Welcome to today's City Council meeting. If you wish to address the Council regarding an item listed on this agenda, please complete a registration form at the rear of the room and place it in the Speaker Request Box located on the Council dais prior to consideration of that item. We ask that speakers limit their comments to 3 minutes and that large groups name a spokesperson whenever possible. Thank you for your interest and participation in City government.

City Council Special Meeting  
Friday, September 14, 2018  
8:30 AM

All proposed ordinances and information on other items listed below, which have been provided in advance of this meeting, may be inspected in the office of the City Clerk, Room B, City Hall, or on the City of Naples home page https://www.naplesgov.com/ or call the City Clerk's Office, 213-1015. All written, audio-visual and other materials presented to the City Council in conjunction with deliberations during this meeting will become the property of the City of Naples and will be retained by the City Clerk.

1. Roll Call
2. Pledge of Allegiance
3. Public Comment
4. City Manager
   4.A. City Manager recruitment process - Interview five candidates for the City of Naples City Manager position

NOTICE

FORMAL ACTION MAY BE TAKEN ON ANY ITEM DISCUSSED OR ADDED TO THIS AGENDA. ANY PERSON WHO DECIDES TO APPEAL ANY DECISION MADE BY THE CITY COUNCIL WITH RESPECT TO ANY MATTER CONSIDERED AT THIS MEETING (OR HEARING) WILL NEED A RECORD OF THE PROCEEDINGS AND MAY NEED TO ENSURE THAT A VERBATIM RECORD OF THE PROCEEDING IS MADE, WHICH RECORD INCLUDES THE TESTIMONY AND EVIDENCE UPON WHICH THE APPEAL IS TO BE HEARD. ANY PERSON WITH A DISABILITY REQUIRING AUXILIARY AIDS AND SERVICES FOR THIS MEETING MAY CALL THE CITY CLERK’S OFFICE AT (239) 213-1015 WITH REQUESTS AT LEAST TWO BUSINESS DAYS BEFORE THE MEETING DATE.
Agenda Memorandum
Evaluation Guide and Sample Questions for City Manager Finalists
Suggested City Manager Selection Procedure
Ballot to Select the City Manager Finalists
Summary of Ballots to Select City Manager Finalists

Adjourn
SUBJECT
City Manager recruitment process - Interview five candidates for the City of Naples City Manager position

Legislative Type:

Funding Source:

Recommendation:

ATTACHMENTS
- Agenda Memorandum
- Evaluation Guide and Sample Questions for City Manager Finalists
- Suggested City Manager Selection Procedure
- Ballot to Select the City Manager Finalists
- Summary of Ballots to Select City Manager Finalists
To: City Council
From: Bill Moss, City Manager
Date: September 7, 2018

Legislative ☒ Quasi-Judicial ☐

SUBJECT:
City Manager recruitment process. Interview five candidates for the City Manager position.

SUMMARY:
City Council is asked to:
1. Interview David Andrews, Charles Chapman, James Dinneen, Erdal Donmez and Joyce Shanahan for the City of Naples City Manager position.
2. Select the preferred candidate and an alternative candidate for the position of City Manager.
3. Authorize the Mayor to negotiate an Employment Agreement for consideration by City Council.

BACKGROUND:
On March 7, 2018 City Council agreed to advertise a Request for Proposals for executive search services to recruit candidates for the position of City Manager. On April 4, 2018, City Council reviewed proposals and selected Colin Baenziger & Associates to conduct the executive search. The firm subsequently met with City Council, developed a recruitment profile, and initiated the recruitment process. Candidates interested in the position were asked to submit resumes by no later than July 9, 2018.

On August 8, 2018 Colin Baenziger & Associates provided City Council with copies of all the resumes that had been submitted for consideration for the City Manager position, along with a candidate report for each of the firm’s recommended eight semi-finalists. On August 15, 2018 City Council voted to interview candidates David Andrews, Charles Chapman, James Dinneen, Erdal Donmez, Mike McNees and Joyce Shanahan. Candidate Mike McNees has since withdrawn his application.

On September 12, 2018 a public reception will be held at the Sugden Theater, 6:00 p.m. to 7:30 p.m. to meet and interact with candidates. On September 13, 2018 each member of City Council will hold private interviews with each candidate. At the September 14, 2018 Special meeting, each candidate will be interviewed by City Council in a public session.
### September 14, 2018 Special Meeting - Finalists Interview Schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Candidate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:30 to 8:40 a.m.</td>
<td>Review procedures for interviews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:40 to 9:10 a.m.</td>
<td>Donmez</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:15 to 9:45 a.m.</td>
<td>Shanahan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:50 to 10:20 a.m.</td>
<td>Dinneen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30 to 11:00 a.m.</td>
<td>Andrews</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:05 a.m. to 11:35 p.m.</td>
<td>Chapman</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**11:45 p.m.: Council discusses finalists and selects the preferred candidate**

**FUNDING SOURCE:**
Not applicable.

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:**
1. Interview candidates David Andrews, Charles Chapman, James Dinneen, Erdal Donmez and Joyce Shanahan for the City of Naples City Manager position.
2. Select a candidate and offer the position. City Council may also choose to select an alternative candidate and authorize the Mayor to offer the position to the alternative candidate if the first candidate declines to accept the position.
3. Authorize the Mayor to negotiate an Employment Agreement for consideration by City Council.

The City Council agenda of September 17, 2018 will include an item to continue the recruitment process if a selection of the preferred candidate is not made on September 14th, and to consider an Employment Agreement if a candidate is selected on September 14th and an Employment Agreement is negotiated prior to the September 17th City Council meeting.
Evaluation Guide and Sample Questions

for

Naples’ City Manager Finalists

Colin Baenziger & Associates
2055 South Atlantic Avenue • Suite 504
Daytona Beach Shores, FL 32118
Cell: (561) 707-3537
Evaluating Candidates

When evaluating candidates, it is important to consider them based on information from a number of sources. The first is the candidates’ experience as presented in their written material (i.e., their resume and/or application for the position). The second is the background review (particularly the references) your consultant has prepared. The third is the actual interview of the candidate. No single source will give you the complete picture so all should be considered.

We have developed the following materials to assist you in evaluating the candidates. They are briefly described in the following paragraphs.

The Evaluation Tool

The Evaluation Tool is a list of the key factors that make someone successful as a City Manager. We recognize you are very successful people and may make decisions using very different approaches to the same issue. For example, some Council Members may wish to use it as a ranking sheet where each factor is given a score of 1 through 5, the scores totaled and the candidates ranked based on the results. Alternatively, other members may wish to use it as a guide to the areas that should be considered and, instead of a specific score, the result might be an overall impression of each candidate. These Council Members might then rank the candidates based on those impressions and not use numerical rankings. You should do whatever you are most comfortable doing.

It should be noted that when using the tool, your evaluation should be based on all the following: the interview, the candidate’s experience as presented in his/her resume and introduction, and the background review the consultant has prepared (the references, news media and background checks). The Evaluation Tool follows on the next page.

The Interview Questions

The questions provided are designed to follow the outline in the Evaluation Tool. It should be noted that not every factor listed on the Tool is addressed with a question. Some factors are best evaluated through the background reports (ability to work with others including the press). Others do not lend themselves to questions but are readily apparent in the interview (communications skills, for example).

Questions Not to Ask

Some areas should not be discussed in an interview. These are described at the end of this package.
Candidate Evaluation Tool

Candidate: __________________________

**Interaction Skills:** Will the candidate interact well with the following groups:

- [ ] The Council
- [ ] Press
- [ ] Employees and unions
- [ ] Other governments
- [ ] The community

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subtotal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Administrative Skills:** The candidate’s experience:

- [ ] Preparing and managing a budget
- [ ] Managing professional and operational staff
- [ ] Developing and executing operational and strategic plans
- [ ] Obtaining and managing grants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subtotal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Technical Skills:** The candidate’s experience in:

- [ ] Day-to-day operations
- [ ] Capital projects
- [ ] Working in a high end community
- [ ] Financial management
- [ ] Economic development / redevelopment
- [ ] Contract negotiations (union and other)

**Personal / Managements Skills:** Ability to

- [ ] Communicate well orally and in writing
- [ ] Select, develop and retain good staff
- [ ] Demonstrate a high degree of ethics

| Subtotal |
Candidate Evaluation Tool

Candidate: ________________________

Track record:

- Demonstrated vision
- Demonstrated ability to lead organizations
- Demonstrated management ability
- Demonstrated creativity
- Demonstrated ability to solve problems
- Demonstrated ability to react well to new and unusual situations
- Record supporting diversity

Subtotal

Total Score:

Notes:
Interview Questions

The following are the questions we at CB&A would ask if we were evaluating City Manager candidates. They are in the same sequence as the Evaluation Tool. It should be noted that the first seven questions are focused on how the candidate will work with the Council. If he/she cannot do that well, nothing else will matter.

You have 50 minutes with each candidate and the result is you will probably not have time to ask all of these questions. Our guess is that you will be able to ask approximately 17 of the following. Consequently, please select the ones you feel will give you the information you need to decide who is the best candidate to be your next City Manager and hold the remainder in reserve. Of course, if you have questions you would prefer to ask, then please do so.

Note: The suggested questions will be provided at a later date so that they are not readily available to the finalists prior to the interviews.
Questions and Topics to Avoid During the Interview Process

A large body of legislation has developed over the years addressing civil rights and race/gender/age discrimination. Questions in these areas should be avoided during the interview process. As a result, the process of interviewing and selecting an applicant is no longer a simple matter of conducting a casual conversation and to learn a candidate’s strengths, weaknesses, likes, and dislikes. Various civil rights laws now make the average interview a process that should be approached with caution. However, if you keep in mind the following basic rules, the process move along smoothly and without issue.

In most instances, asking inappropriate questions may raise an inference of either discrimination or retaliation against a particular candidate. In other instances, such as those involving issues of mental or physical health, inappropriate questions are presumptively discriminatory. Therefore, the interviewer must avoid questions relating to the following:

1. Political affiliation, political views, or voting history.
2. Religious beliefs or practices.
3. A candidate’s race.
4. A candidate’s age.
5. A candidate’s national origin or ancestry.
6. A candidate’s family and whether or not they would be willing/able to join them in the new location.
7. A candidate’s desire to have children or raise a family.
9. Sexual orientation or sexual practices.
10. Marital status or personal and private relationships.
11. Potentially controversial issues of race, gender or ethnicity.

Any information a candidate may volunteer during the interview process regarding these matters does not render the interview invalid or otherwise taint the process. Consequently, open-ended questions, such as asking if the candidate wants to reveal anything else that has not already been covered, are not prohibited. In fact, they can sometimes provide valuable insight into a candidate’s views and perspectives.
Questions and Topics to Avoid During the Interview Process

With regard to issues of physical or mental health, many questions are appropriate after a conditional offer of employment has been made, but must be avoided beforehand. The interviewer must avoid questions relating to the following topics:

1. A candidate’s medical history.
2. Past workers’ compensation claims.
3. Past use of sick leave.
4. Health of a candidate’s family members.
5. Any obvious physical or mental impairment of the candidate. Although it is permissible to ask if the candidate is able to perform the essential functions of the job for which he/she is applying, it is probably better is not to ask this type of question at all. Of course, from a practical point of view, it is hard to imagine anyone answering negatively.
6. A candidate’s frequency of illegal drug use or addiction. However, it is permissible to ask if the candidate ever used illegal drugs, and if so, the last time he/she did so. Once again, this is a very delicate area that can create significant problems for the employer if the questioning is intrusive.
7. Alcoholism or the frequency of alcohol consumption.

The questions listed above which relate to medical conditions may properly be asked of a candidate after he or she has received a conditional offer of employment. Before an offer is made, however, the questions must be avoided.

If you need further assistance in crafting proper interview questions, please do not hesitate to contact us for further guidance.
The Council can select the City Manager in a number of ways. The following is the procedure we have used over the years and that we recommend.

**General**

We suggest the Council begin with a straw poll involving completing the attached ballot. Once the votes are tabulated, the preferred candidate(s) will quickly be identified while the others are eliminated. This approach saves the Council time. You do not need to discuss candidates that most of you are less interested in. It also saves embarrassment for the candidates who are not highly ranked.

**Suggested Procedure**

With the ballot, each Council Member selects his/her top two candidates but does not rank them. You simply put a check mark next to the preferred candidates’ names. The consultant reads the ballots aloud. The City Clerk or Attorney records the votes on a tally sheet so that the process is totally transparent. The votes are then summed, and the results announced. Usually two candidates will have the support of a majority of the Council Members. The question then becomes, “Which candidate does the Council want to be the next City Manager?” That may engender some discussion, or a second vote can immediately be taken. Note: Since the initial straw poll did not involve ranking, it is possible that a candidate may be the first choice of a majority of the Council but have fewer total votes. Hence, a second vote is necessary.

**Comment**

It should be noted that all the candidates are highly qualified but since each Council Member only has two votes and we have five candidates, it is not unusual for a very strong candidate not to receive any votes.
City of Naples, FL

Ballot to Select the City Manager Finalists
September 14, 2018

Please place a check mark next to your top two choices to be your next City Manager.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Candidate</th>
<th>Select</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 David Andrews</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Charles “Charlie” Chapman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 James “Jim” Dinneen</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Erdal Donmez</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Joyce Shanahan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Signature: __________________________________________________________________

Submitted by (please place a check mark next to your name):

- Barnett
- Price
- Buxton
- Hutchinson
- McLeod
- Penniman
- Seigel
City of Naples, FL

Summary of Ballots to Select City Manager Finalists, Round # ___

September 7, 2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Candidate</th>
<th>Barnett</th>
<th>Price</th>
<th>Buxton</th>
<th>Hutchinson</th>
<th>McLeod</th>
<th>Penniman</th>
<th>Seigel</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>David Andrews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles Chapman</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Dinneen</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erdal Donmez</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joyce Shanahan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Compiled by: _________________________________